SUPER MANN-WHITNEY SIMULATION OF SYSTEM RELIABILITY*

Laurence L. George
Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory
P. O. Box 808, L-140
Livermore, CA 94550 USA

Abstract

Simulation of system reliability requires an enormous amount of computer time if system reliability is high. If the simulation generates values of component loads and strengths, the values from different runs may be combined to increase the number of runs without generating any more values. The reliability estimator is the proportion of runs without system failure. It is unbiased regardless of the run combining methods. The variance of the reliability estimator can be derived from the variance of Mann-Whitney test statistic or by a jackknife estimator.

Run combining methods mix simulated loads and strengths from different runs. If only loads are combined, the method is called Mann-Whitney simulation. This is because, if the system has one component, the reliability estimator is related to Mann-Whitney test statistic. If all of loads and strengths are combined, the method is superior to the Mann-Whitney simulation because far more samples are generated. This method is called Super Mann-Whitney simulation.

Mann-Whitney and Super Mann-Whitney simulations are practical only if random variable generation is hard.

INTRODUCTION

Component reliability is the probability of component survival. Component survival can be modeled as occurring when load is less than strength (1). System reliability is the probability of survival of some subset of components. A fault tree specifies which subsets are required for survival. System reliability is modeled this way in the Seismic Safety Margins Research Program (2).

System reliability computation is difficult because:

1. there are many components,
2. there are many subsets whose survival causes system survival, and
3. loads and strengths are dependent among themselves and on each other.

System reliability simulation is an alternative, but simulation requires a large number of simulation runs if component reliabilities are high. (Figure 1 shows system reliability simulation.) Mann-Whitney simulation (3) requires far fewer simulation runs. (Figure 2 shows Mann-Whitney simulation.) It re-uses every one of the n**2 combinations of simulated loads and strengths to estimate system reliability. Basu (4) uses this technique to estimate component reliability. Super Mann-Whitney simulation is the same as Mann-Whitney simulation except that it uses all combinations of load-strength pairs. (Figure 3 shows Super Mann-Whitney simulation.)

For example, suppose there are m=2 components, n=2 loads and strengths for each component, and n**2=4 load-strength pairs for each component. There are n**(2*m)-16 pairs of pairs, and each yields a distinct system state, survival or failure. (Figure 4 lists all combinations.) Check each component to see whether its load X is less than its strength Y, then check to see whether at least one subset of components required for system survival has loads less than strengths. If so, count one more survival.

*This work was supported by the U. S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission under a memorandum of understanding with the U. S. Department of Energy.

Proceedings of the 1982 Winter Simulation Conference
Highland * Chao * Madrigal, Editors
82CH1844-0/82/0000-0457 $00.75 © 1982 IEEE
Super Mann-Whitney Simulation (continued).

FIGURE 1
Simple Simulation of Mechanical System Reliability

- Input sets of components required for system survival and load and strength probability distributions.
- Generate pairs of load and strength for all components.
- Does system survive?
  - Yes: Increase survival counter, \( h = h + 1 \)
  - No: No, have all \( n \) runs been made?
    - Yes: Stop
    - No: Yes
- Reliability \( \hat{\beta} = \frac{h}{n} \), Var \( \hat{\beta} = \frac{h(n-h)}{n^2} \)
- Stop

FIGURE 2
Mann-Whitney Simulation of System Reliability

- Input sets of components required for system survival and load and strength probability distributions.
- Generate all \( n \) pairs of loads and strengths.
- Count how often system survives, \( \hat{\beta} \) out of all \( n \) combinations.
- Reliability \( \hat{\beta} = \frac{\hat{\beta}}{n} \), Var \( \hat{\beta} \) is obtained by separate computation.
- Stop

FIGURE 3
Super Mann-Whitney Simulation of System Reliability

- Input sets of components required for system survival and load and strength probability distributions.
- Generate all \( n \) pairs of loads and strengths.
- Count how often system survives out of all \( n \) combinations of loads, strength and components.
- Reliability \( \hat{\beta} = \frac{3}{n^2} \), Var \( \hat{\beta} \) is obtained by separate computation.
- Stop

FIGURE 4
Combinations of Loads and Strengths for Two Components and Two Runs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index</th>
<th>Loads</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>( x_{11}^* ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{21} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{11} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>( x_{12} ) ( x_{21} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>( x_{11} ) ( x_{22} )</td>
<td>( y_{12} ) ( y_{22} )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The first subscript is the component number and the second is the run number.
SYSTEM RELIABILITY ESTIMATION

The proportions of survivors in all simulation runs are system reliability estimators. For simple simulation of n independent runs with h survivors, the estimator is h/n. For Mann-Whitney simulation of n*(n+2) runs with i survivors, the estimator is i/(n*(n+2)). For Super Mann-Whitney simulation of n*(2m) runs with j survivors, the estimator is j/(n*(2m)).

Estimators should be accompanied by indications of their accuracy. The proportions are unbiased estimators. Variances of the proportions indicate the accuracy of the proportion estimators. For simple simulation, the variance of the proportion is estimated by h*(n-h)/(n*(n+3)). For Mann-Whitney simulation, the variance of the proportion is derived from the variance of the Mann-Whitney test statistic (5) n*(n*(2n+1))/12, when the loads and strengths have the same distribution functions (except for a location parameter). For Super Mann-Whitney simulation, the variance of the proportion is estimated by a jackknife (6). The jackknife requires computing the proportion estimator many times where each computation is based on all but one run. The variance estimator is a function of the proportion estimators (6).

Confidence intervals on system reliability can be estimated from the distribution function of the proportion of survivors. The exact distribution of the Mann-Whitney test statistic can be computed for small n (7). The asymptotic distribution for large n is normal. For Super Mann-Whitney simulation, the distribution of the proportion depends on the definition of system survival. The distribution can be approximated using extreme value theory of dependent random variables for series or parallel systems (8).

TESTS

The following alternatives were tested:

1. DUMSIM - simple simulation as in Figure 1 using "IF" statements to determine whether X-Y for component failure.
2. EFFSIM - simple simulation of a series system using a vector minimization on the vector Z=X-Y. If Z>0, the system survives.
3. MKSIM - Mann-Whitney simulation of system reliability as in Figure 2.
4. DUMSIMJK - the same as DUMSIM with a jackknife variance estimator.
5. MKSIMJK - Mann-Whitney simulation of system reliability with a jackknife variance estimator.
6. SUPERMANN - Super Mann-Whitney system reliability simulation as in Figure 3.

The numbers of runs were 11, 25, 100. The probabilities of component failures (independent events) were 0.5. All systems were components in series. The numbers of components were 1, 2 and 4 so the correct reliabilities were 0.5, 0.25 and 0.0625.

Table 1 shows the results. EFFSIM was not included because its execution time was worse than DUMSIM. Vector minimization takes more time than several "IF" statements. The reliability estimator is δ. Its variance is estimated by δ² or δ²(JK). The run times for random variable generation, δ computation and the jackknife variance estimation are given in microseconds on a CDC 7600 computer. Core requirement was about 3 percent.

CONCLUSIONS

1. Mann-Whitney simulation of single component reliability reduces variance a little but requires about 10 times the CPU time.
2. Mann-Whitney plus Jackknife reduces variance at a huge cost of CPU time.
3. Jackknife alone does not reduce variance.
4. Super Mann-Whitney simulation requires a horrible amount of CPU time.

Therefore, use Mann-Whitney or Super Mann-Whitney simulation only if random variables are hard to generate.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Super Mann-Whitney Simulation (continued)


DISCLAIMER

This document was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government nor the University of California nor any of their employees, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial products, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government or the University of California. The views and opinions of authors expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government thereof, and shall not be used for advertising or product endorsement purposes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROGRAM</th>
<th>NUMBER OF COMPONENTS</th>
<th>NUMBER OF RUNS</th>
<th>$\hat{\beta}$</th>
<th>$\hat{\delta}_\beta$</th>
<th>$\hat{\delta}_{\beta}(JK)$</th>
<th>$\hat{\mu}_{sec}(RN)$</th>
<th>$\hat{\mu}_{sec}(P)$</th>
<th>$\hat{\mu}_{sec}(JK)$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMH</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.09992+</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>4307</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMH</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.46</td>
<td>.0498</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>16486</td>
<td>527</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSND</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.4782</td>
<td>.0825</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>4178</td>
<td>2589</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSND</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.5175</td>
<td>.0409</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>16598</td>
<td>40583</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMK</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.0992+</td>
<td>.10199</td>
<td>4182</td>
<td>174</td>
<td>3041</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSNDK</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.4782</td>
<td>.0392+</td>
<td>.01999</td>
<td>4401</td>
<td>2666</td>
<td>2,387,579</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMX</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>.0392+</td>
<td>.04</td>
<td>16704</td>
<td>301</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSX</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.0992</td>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>16372</td>
<td>5993</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMK</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.4782</td>
<td>.0825</td>
<td>.01999</td>
<td>4227</td>
<td>2603</td>
<td>6179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSNDX</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.0992</td>
<td>.0120</td>
<td>.01999</td>
<td>16674</td>
<td>6007</td>
<td>4,499,250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHSX</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.0992</td>
<td></td>
<td>.0120</td>
<td>16393</td>
<td>6089</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DUNSMX</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>.0700</td>
<td>.02355</td>
<td>.02564</td>
<td>64536</td>
<td>993</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPHRMN</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>.2657</td>
<td></td>
<td>---</td>
<td>8095</td>
<td>1550123</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPHRMN</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>.117</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7324</td>
<td>1,336,394,093</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* The Mann-Whitney estimate of asymptotic standard deviation of $\hat{\beta}$ is correct only when the number of components is 1.

+ For DUNSMX, true $\hat{\sigma}_\beta = \sqrt{p(1-p)/25} = .1$ when the number of components = 1 and $\hat{\sigma}_\beta = .0484$ when the number of components = 4.